

Douglas Tullis
Solicitor
The Penrose Inquiry
44 Drumsheugh Gardens
Edinburgh
EH3 7SW

Please quote this reference

FTM/ PMG/TAMBURRINI/Y10G0274

24 February 2011

Dear Mr Tullis

THE LATE MR VICTOR TAMBURRINI

We have received and considered a number of documents, records and reports in relation to this matter. The material would appear to leave a question mark relative to the source of the infection of Hepatitis C in this case. Some matters arise:

- (1) Mrs Tamburrini's statement indicates that a payment was made from the Skipton fund to Mr Tamburrini shortly before his death. We are not sure what material was used to support this application but it does appear to have been accepted that infection did occur as a result of treatment by the NHS in Scotland. We think that it is important that whatever material was relied upon in this respect should be available for examination and scrutiny if at all possible.
- (2) We have, at present, no clear understanding as to why it can be asserted with such certainty that in relation to the 7 September 1984 blood transfusion Mr Tamburrini received a batch of blood that had been heat treated to the extent and in the manner indicated. Is there no room for a mix up as between the batch recorded as administered and the plasma in fact administered? It may be that our question here arises from a lack of understanding of the process but it should be kept in mind that we do not have any expertise at our disposal to explain it to us.
- (3) We have a real concern that all was not well at PFC Liberton in the early 1980's. The Inquiry is aware that inspections were carried out by the Medicines Inspectorate in 1981 and 1988 (the latter inspection report being produced at SNB.008.8791). The 1981 report appears to be concerned *inter alia* about the possibility of product mix up and the possibility of contamination of components and product. The 1988 report also makes detailed criticism of the conditions at Liberton. Moreover we enclose a letter dated 20 July 1988 from Dr Cash to Mr J T Donald complaining about the standard of facilities at Liberton. He was of the view that PFC "has and is operating outwith the standards of the pharmaceutical industry". This letter and content of the reports of the Medical Inspectorate do not sit well with the statement in the paper forwarded with the Tamburrini documents entitled SPPS Batch Number 1194 Statement of

Clarification which states at section 4 under the heading "Details of the Heat Treatment Process"

"It should be noted that although SNBTS operated under Crown Immunity this operation was inspected by the UK Medicines Inspectorate and was found to be suitable and was eventually licensed when Crown Immunity was withdrawn in 1991."

We think that it is vitally important that the Inquiry considers whether there is any potential link between the documented unsatisfactory state of affairs at Liberton during the 1980's and the possible infection of Mr Tamburrini with Hepatitis C as a result of transfusion in September 1984. It is not clear to us that it is not feasible for that to have occurred.

We would be grateful to receive any comment that the Inquiry has in relation to these matters

Yours faithfully

THOMPSONS

LF