

Scottish Government Legal Directorate
Litigation Division



T: [REDACTED] F: [REDACTED]
E: [REDACTED]

Ms Lindsey Robertson
The Penrose Inquiry

BY EMAIL ONLY

Your ref:
Our ref: JNL
13 February 2012

Dear Ms Robertson

**THE PENROSE INQUIRY
B2 – USE OF COMMERCIAL BLOOD PRODUCTS – BIOLOGICALS SUB-COMMITTEE
OF THE CSM**

I refer to the above matter.

There was discussion during the oral hearings on the B2 topic of Dr Galbraith's proposal of May 1983, which appears to have been discussed at the meeting of the Biologicals Sub-Committee on 13th July 1983. Dr McClelland queried whether there might have been SHHD attendance at the meeting (Day 61, page 109). The Inquiry did not ask me to look into this, but for completeness my colleagues and I have made some enquiries.

We have been advised that SHHD staff were not members of the CSM or its sub-committees. They did occasionally attend meetings as observers. The two members of staff whom we have been able to identify as occasional attendees are Dr Boyd Moir, formerly of the Chief Scientist Office, and Professor Graham Calder, formerly SHHD's Chief Pharmacist. Neither witness attended the sub-committee meeting in question. We have also found no trace in any of the remaining blood policy files of any papers relating to this meeting, which is perhaps not surprising given the confidential nature of these meetings.

I trust this information is of assistance.

Yours sincerely

**Jill N Lavelle
Solicitor**

Victoria Quay, Edinburgh EH6 6QQ
Hays DX 557000, Edinburgh 20
www.scotland.gov.uk

